

GOA STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION

"Kamat Towers" 7th Floor, Patto Plaza, Panaji, Goa – 403 001

E-mail: spio-gsic.goa@nic.in Website: www.scic.goa.gov.in

Appeal No.33/2026/SCIC

Uma R. Shinde,
H. No. 114/12, Kasarwada,
Khorlim, Mapusa Goa 403507

-----Appellant

V/s

1. The Public Information Officer,
Bal Bhavan, Campal,
Panaji Goa 403001.

2. The First Appellate Authority,
Bal Bhavan, Campal,
Panaji Goa 403001

-----Respondents

Shri. ARAVIND KUMAR H. NAIR - State Chief Information Commissioner, GSIC

Relevant Facts Emerging from the Appeal

RTI application filed on	02/07/2025
PIO replied on	29/07/2025
First Appeal filed on	26/08/2025
First Appellate order on	26/08/2025
Second appeal received on	22/01/2026
First Hearing	18/03/2026
Decided on	18/03/2026

Information sought and Background of the Appeal

1. Ms. Uma R. Shinde filed an application dated 02/07/2025 under RTI Act, 2005 to the PIO, Bal Bhavan, Panaji, Goa seeking following information :
 - i. " Copy of appointment order of Ms. Uma Shinde to the post of LDC, Bal Bhavan.
 - ii. Copy of appointment order of Smt. Shilpa Bhonsle to the post of LDC, Bal Bhavan.
 - iii. Copy of outward register book from Sr. No. 885 to 895 for the year 2013.
 - iv. Copy of service book of Ms. Uma Shinde.
 - v. Copy of service book of Smt. Shilpa Bhonsle".

2. In response to the RTI application of the Appellant, PIO, Bal Bhavan vide letter dated 29/07/2025 furnished information in respect of Point No. 1, 3 and 4 of the RTI application but denied information sought at Point No. 2 and 5, as it is personal information of Smt. Shilpa N. Bhonsle, third party, who has made objection to furnish her personal information.

3. Being aggrieved by the denial of information pertaining to RTI query No. 2 and 5 of the application dated 02/07/2025, Appellant filed first appeal dated 26/08/2025 before the First Appellate Authority praying for direction to the Respondent PIO to furnish information pertaining to Appointment Order and Service Book of Smt. Shilpa N. Bhonsle to the Appellant.

4. First Appellate Authority after hearing both the parties to the first appeal passed an order dated 26/08/2025 as under :
 - i. *"The copy of the appointment order of Smt. Shilpa Bhonsle to the post of LDC shall be provided free of cost to the Appellant within 06 working days.*
 - ii. *With reference to the information sought at Sr. No. 05, the Appellant has not sought any specific information from the service book and the request is general and vague in nature.*
 - iii. *Service book constitutes personal information of a third party and is exempted from disclosure under section 8(1) (j) of the RTI Act, 2005.*
 - iv. *No larger public interest has been established to override the exemption".*

5. Subsequently, Appellant preferred second appeal dated 22/01/2026 before the Commission praying for direction to the Respondent PIO to furnish information sought by the Appellant at Point No. 5 (copy of service book of Smt. Shilpa Bhonsle) of her RTI application dated 02/07/2025. Copy of the service book may be provided after severing any information that may be considered as personal u/s 10(1) of the RTI Act.

FACTS EMERGING IN COURSE OF HEARING

6. Pursuant to the filing of the present appeal, parties were notified fixing the matter for hearing on 18/03/2026 for which Adv. Akhil Parrikar appeared for the Appellant and Respondent PIO present in person.

During the course of argument, in order to strengthen Appellant's prayer for furnishing copy of the service book, Adv. Akhil Parrikar placed Central Information Commission's decision on February 03, 2011 in ***Shri. Anant Kumar V. Chittarjen Locomotive Works, West Bengal wherein CIC*** held that service details of public servants available in the service book cannot be treated as personal information and also CIC's decision dated March 21, 2012 in ***Shri. Ramachandra V/s Directorate of Education, Government of NCT of Delhi*** that service details of government employees are not completely exempt from disclosure under the Provision of the RTI Act.

DECISION

- i. **As the Presiding Commissioner comes to know during the course of argument that Appellant is primarily looking for the educational qualification of the third party (Smt. Shilpa N. Bhonsle), an employee of Bal Bhavan, Panaji, Goa, Commission hereby directed the Respondent PIO to furnish the Appellant, certified copy of the educational qualification certificate submitted by the third party at the time of joining as an employee at Bal Bhavan and if the public authority (Bal Bhavan) is not in possession of the said educational qualification certificate, provide certified particular pages of the service book (pages having name of the third party and the particular page in which educational qualification of the third party is mentioned) to the Appellant within a week time from the date of receipt of this order.**

ii. Compliance report should reach the Commission within 10 days from the receipt of this order.

- Matter disposed
- Proceeding stands closed.
- Pronounced in open court.
- Notify the parties.

Aggrieved party if any, may move against this order by way of a Writ Petition as no further Appeal is provided against this order under the Right to Information Act, 2005.

Sd/-

(ARAVIND KUMAR H. NAIR)
State Chief Information Commissioner, GSIC